2015 and 2017 CARIS Base Case Assumptions Matrix Comparison

For Discussion at the June 22, 2017 ESPWG

(updates in RED)

Parameter	Modeling for 2015 CARIS Base Cases	Modeling for 2017 CARIS Base Cases
Peak Load	Based on 2015 Load & Capacity Data Report ("Gold Book") Baseline Forecast of Non-Coincident Peak Demand, including impacts of statewide Energy Efficiency programs (Table 1-2b)	Based on 2017 Load & Capacity Data Report ("Gold Book") Baseline Forecast of Non-Coincident Peak Demand, including impacts of statewide Energy Efficiency programs (Table TBD)
Load Shape Model Energy Forecast	2002 Load Shape.Energy Forecast Baseline Forecast of Annual Energy, including impacts of statewide Energy Efficiency programs (Table 1-2a)	2002 Load Shape. Energy Forecast Baseline Forecast of Annual Energy, including impacts of statewide Energy Efficiency programs (Table TBD)
Load Uncertainty Model	Only Base Level Forecast utilized; the impact of energy or peak forecasts may be utilized in scenarios	Only Base Level Forecast utilized; the impact of energy or peak forecasts may be utilized in scenarios
Generating Unit Capacities	Updated to reflect 2015 Gold Book winter and summer DMNC values	Updated to reflect 2017 Gold Book winter and summer DMNC values
New Units	Updated as per 2015 Gold Book (Application of inclusion rules identified in Reliability Planning Process Manual, Section 3.1.1 and procedures)procedures)	Updated as per 2017 Gold Book (Application of inclusion rules identified in Reliability Planning Process Manual, Section 3.1.1 and procedures)
Wind Resource Modeling	Units and capacities updated as per 2015 Gold Book. Wind resources are modeled based on unit capacities and synthesized wind shapes developed as part of 2010 Wind Study.	Units and capacities updated as per 2017 Gold Book. Existing wind resources are modeled based on unit capacities and actual 2015 shapes. New units modeled based on proximate existing units.

Parameter	Modeling for 2015 CARIS Base Cases	Modeling for 2017 CARIS Base Cases
Non-NYPA Hydro Capacity Modeling	Updated as per 2015 Gold Book; unit output is modeled consistent with historic levels.	Updated as per 2017 Gold Book; unit output is modeled consistent with historic levels.
Special Case Resources	Not utilized in MAPS production cost modeling; incorporated in ICAP Metric calculation	Not utilized in MAPS production cost modeling; incorporated in ICAP Metric calculation
EDRP Resources	N/A for production cost modeling	N/A for production cost modeling
External Capacity – Purchases and Wheel- Throughs	Flows across schedulable and non-schedulable transmission lines are based on economics.	Flows across schedulable and non-schedulable transmission lines are based on economics.
Retirements	Updated as per 2015 Gold Book (Application of inclusion rules; specific assumptions concerning mothball announcement post-CRP; units with completed studies indicating that the unit is required for reliability are retained in the Base Case; units whose studies are pending are retained in the Base Case; others are excluded from the Base Case)	Updated as per 2017 Gold Book (Application of inclusion rules; specific assumptions concerning mothball announcement post-CRP; units with completed studies indicating that the unit is required for reliability are retained in the Base Case; units whose studies are pending are retained in the Base Case; others are excluded from the Base Case)
Generator Outages	Scheduled to levelize reserves; as per the maintenance schedules in long term adequacy studies.	Scheduled to levelize reserves; as per the maintenance schedules in long term adequacy studies.
Gas Turbines Ambient Derate	Modeling utilizes summer and winter DMNC ratings for all units.	Modeling utilizes summer and winter DMNC ratings for all units.

Parameter	Modeling for 2015 CARIS Base Cases	Modeling for 2017 CARIS Base Cases
Environmental Modeling	Allowance costs based on	TBD. Under review with
Externalities	SO_2 and NO_x Allowance Prices reflect new CSAPR	E3FWG (as of $0/22/2017)$.
Allowances	markets.	
	SO ₂ based on CSAPR price (\$100 / Ton) decreased 10% until 2017, at which point Phase II will increase price by 25% and decrease thereafter at 20% per annum.	
	Annual ($100 / Ton$) and Ozone Season NO _x ($125 / Ton$) follow same trend as SO ₂ Allowance Prices.	
	Detailed allowance costs are provided in the 5/4/15 ESPWG meeting materials.	
Commitment and Dispatch Options	Each Balancing Authority commits to serve its own load, firm transactions, and potential transfers	Each Balancing Authority commits to serve its own load, firm transactions, and potential transfers
	Hurdle rates – flat. As presented on 5/4/15 to ESPWG.	Hurdle rates – flat Same. Precise values pending conclusion of benchmarking analysis. Will be reported to ESPWG.
Operating Reserves	Operating Reserves as per NYCA requirements.	Operating Reserves as per NYCA requirements.

Paramatar	Modeling for 2015 CARIS	Modeling for 2017 CARIS
Falameter	Dase Cases	Dase Cases
Fuel Price Forecast	Annual bases updated to more heavily weight recent trends (2012-0.100, 2013- 0.325, 2014-0.575).	TBD. Under review with ESPWG (as of 6/22/2017).
	Seasonality and spikes based on five-year history (2010-2014). Fuel oil and coal price forecasts are developed utilizing the EIA's annual forecast of national delivered prices. Regional bases are derived using EIA Form 923 data. The seasonality for fuel oils is based on an analysis of New York Harbor Ultra- Low Sulfur Diesel (ULSD) prices. Coal has no seasonality.	
Coat Ourse	ESPWG meeting materials.	Linit hast rates (and
Development (including	emission rates) developed	emission rates) developed
heat rates and emission rates)	trom vendor supplied data, USEPA CAMD fuel input and emissions data matched with NYISO production data for NYCA and USEIA production data for non NYCA units.	from vendor supplied data, USEPA CAMD fuel input and emissions data matched with NYISO production data for NYCA and USEIA production data for non NYCA units.
Local Reliability Rules	List and develop appropriate nomograms. Fuel burn restrictions, operating restrictions and exceptions, commitment/dispatch limits	List and develop appropriate nomograms. Fuel burn restrictions, operating restrictions and exceptions, commitment/dispatch limits
Energy Storage Gilboa PSH Lewiston PSH	Scheduling checked to conform to historical operations.	Scheduling checked to conform to historical operations.

Parameter	Modeling for 2015 CARIS Base Cases	Modeling for 2017 CARIS Base Cases
Transmission System Model		
Power Flow Cases	As per CRP.	As per CRP.
Interface Limits Monitored/contingency pairs	Data from the results of internal and external planning studies; vendor- supplied data; operational voltage studies; operational limits: transfer limit analysis	Data from the results of internal and external planning studies; vendor- supplied data; operational voltage studies; operational limits: transfer limit analysis
Nomograms	for critical interfaces.	for critical interfaces.
Joint, Grouping		
Unit Sensitive Voltage		
New Transmission Capability	Updated as per 2015 Gold Book (Application of base case inclusion rules)	Updated as per 2017 Gold Book (Application of base case inclusion rules)
Internal Controllable Lines (PARs,DC,VFT)	Optimized in simulation.	Optimized in simulation.
Neighboring Systems		
Outside World Area Models Fuel Forecast	Power flow data from CRP, "production" data developed by NYISO with vendor and neighbor input.	Power flow data from CRP, "production" data developed by NYISO with vendor and neighbor input.
	Fuel forecasts developed utilizing same methodology as NYCA fuel forecasts.	Fuel forecasts developed utilizing same methodology as NYCA fuel forecasts.
External Capacity And Load Forecast	Neighboring systems modeled consistent with reserve margins in the RNA/CRP analysis. Neighboring systems data reviewed and held at required reserve margin.	Neighboring systems modeled consistent with reserve margins in the RNA/CRP analysis. Neighboring systems data reviewed and held at required reserve margin.

	Modeling for 2015 CARIS	Modeling for 2017 CARIS
Parameter	Base Cases	Base Cases
System representation in	HQ modeled as fixed hourly	HQ modeled as fixed hourly
Simulation	other external injections.	other external injections.
	,	,,
	Full Representation/Participation:	Full Representation/Participation:
	ISONE	ISONE
	IESO	IESO
	PJM Classic & AP,AEP,CE,DLCO,	PJM Classic & AP,AEP,CE,DLCO,
	DAY, VP	DAY, VP, EKPC
		Proxy Bus Injection:
	NEISO HO – IESO	NEISO HO $-$ IESO
	Transmission Only/Zeroed Out:	Transmission Only/Zeroed Out:
	MECS, FE, SPP, MAR,	MECS, FE, SPP, MAR,
	FRCC.SERC.ERCOT.WECC	FRCC.SERC.ERCOT.WECC
External Controllable	A.B.C and J.K "wheel"	PJM/NYISO AC Interface
Lines (PARs,DC,VFT,	Both sets set at 1000 (+/-	modeling modified to reflect
Radial lines)	100) imbalance monitored	current PJM/NYISO JOA, as
	Ramapo "wheel" reflects	reflected in 6/22/2017
	current updated protocols,	ESPWG meeting materials.
	tariff and market operations,	
	including NYISO Technical	
	Bulletins and inter-control	
	area operating agreements.	
	61% of Interchange	
	Schedules across NY-PJM	
	AC ties flow across Ramapo	
	PARS.	
	In addition, 80% of RECO	
	Ramano PARS	
	Norwalk (-200MW +200MW)	Norwalk (-200MW +200MW)
	L33.34 (-300MW, +300MW)	L33.34 (-300MW, +300MW)
	PV20 (0MW, +150MW)	PV20 (0MW, +150MW)
	Neptune (0MW, +660MW)	Neptune (0MW, +660MW)
	CSC (0MW, +330MW)	CSC (0MW, +330MW)
	CSC and Neptune optimized	CSC and Neptune optimized
	subject to "cost of use"	subject to "cost of use"
	HTP (0, 660)	HTP (0, 660)
	Linden VFT (-315,315)	Linden VFT (-315,315)